



THE ADVOCATE

Cayuga-Onondaga BOCES
Office of Personnel Relations
1879 West Genesee Street Road
Auburn, New York 13021-9430

Office of Personnel Relations

Randy J. Ray
Director of Personnel Relations

Nicholas Minderler
Mark Detwiler
Stacy Tamburrino
Labor Relations Specialists

Jack Mekeel
Safety Coordinator

Christine Barbagallo
Kelly Walsh
Administrative Assistants

Telephone: (315) 255-7683 or
(315) 253-0361
FAX: (315) 255-7625
Email: kwalsh@cayboces.org

Providing comprehensive
employment and personnel
relations services to local
school districts for over
45 years.

VOLUME XLIV SEPTEMBER - OCTOBER 2024

IN THIS ISSUE

- + **NEW MEMBERS TO THE
BOARD OF EDUCATION**
- + **WHAT IS "SOLICITATION"
UNDER FOIL?**
- + **THE SUPREME COURT
CASE OF MULDROW V.
CITY OF ST. LOUIS: A
CAUTIONARY TALE**
- + **LEGAL UPDATE: APPR**
- + **AREA TEACHERS AND
NON-INSTRUCTIONAL
SETTLEMENTS**
- + **AREA UNEMPLOYMENT
RATES FOR AUGUST 2024**
- + **CONSUMER PRICE
INDICES FOR JULY
AND AUGUST 2024**

New Members to the Board of Education

Governor Hochul recently signed into legislation a bill amending school district and BOCES requirements for allowing ex officio student board members. Currently, school districts have the option to include ex officio student board members via voter referendum once every two years – BOCES currently has no option or requirement. Additionally, only students that were seniors and attended high school for two years were eligible to be seated on the Board. Many districts informally allowed ex officio student board members without following the formal voting requirements. Therefore, NYS sought to end these practices and make it easier for students to engage in the school community, gain valuable civic experience, and provide their perspective. Beginning July 1, 2025, school districts and BOCES are required to designate at least one student as an ex officio board member – the choice will no longer be up to a voter referendum.

Specifically, districts must create a method to designate at least one student ex officio member and ensure that the schools are all fairly represented, particularly districts with more than one high school.¹ Other requirements include:

- The student(s) shall be entitled to sit with board members at all public meetings and hearings. The board may also, in its discretion, allow the student(s) to participate in other board activities and responsibilities.
- The student(s) shall not be allowed to vote, attend executive session or any other hearings or meetings not open to the public.

¹ The law indicates that districts with policies that were effective prior to August 5, 2003, that allowed student ex officio members to meet these requirements and have full legal effect.

- The student(s) shall not be allowed to receive any form of compensation for their participation.
- The student(s) may be selected in one of the following ways: (1) duly elected student body president of the high school; (2) a student duly elected by the student body; (3) a student selected by the high school student government; (4) a student selected by the high school principal; (5) a student selected by the superintendent; or (6) a student selected by the majority vote of the school board.
- The student(s) must have attended the applicable high school for at least one year prior to selection (i.e., sophomores, juniors or seniors).

BOCES have slightly different parameters. The number of students required must be based on the number of component school districts. BOCES with 10 or fewer components must have at least 1 student; BOCES with 11–20 components must have at least 2 students; and BOCES with more than 20 components must have at least 3 students. The BOCES must establish a process for determining which component district or districts select the ex officio member(s) each school year. The process must allow for fair representation considering the number of components. The student(s) must attend a high school in a component for at least one year and participate in a program administered by the BOCES. The law also requires:

- The student(s) shall be entitled to sit with the board members at all public meetings and hearings. The board may also, in its discretion, allow the student(s) to participate in other board activities and responsibilities.
- The student(s) shall not be allowed to vote, attend executive session or any other hearings or meetings not open to the public.

- The student(s) shall not be allowed to receive any form of compensation for their participation.

While the goal of the law is to increase student civic engagement, there are a few remaining questions. For instance, will the student members be held to the same attendance requirements, the same decorum standards, receive indemnification if named in litigation as a member of the board or receive due process before removal? Other murky areas include the types of information the students may receive, especially regarding employee and/or student issues.

As we await further guidance, if any, it would be advisable to start planning for the addition of ex officio student board members sooner rather than later. Districts and BOCES should start developing a fair process for selecting students and start exploring options to deal with some of the grey areas discussed above.



What is “Solicitation” Under FOIL?

Freedom of Information Law (“FOIL”) imposes a broad duty for governmental agencies (i.e., school districts) to disclose information unless a specific exemption applies. One exemption states that an agency can deny disclosing documents if the disclosure would constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. An example of an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy is when the “sale or release of lists of names and addresses if such lists would be used for solicitation or fund-raising purposes.” See New York Public Officers Law § 89(2)(b).

A recent decision from the Appellate Division, Fourth Department, has added clarity to what the term “solicitation” means. In *Freedom Foundation v. Jefferson County*, the Freedom Foundation sent a FOIL request to Jefferson County seeking information from bargaining unit members, including name, gender, work address, job title, hire date, department, work email, work telephone number and bargaining unit. Jefferson County denied the request as an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy because the information would be used for solicitation or fund-raising purposes. In its decision, the Fourth Department examined the usual and commonly understood meaning of the term “solicitation” since it was not defined in the law. The Freedom Foundation argued that “solicitation” required a financial gain, which they did not receive because they only wanted to educate the employees about their constitutional rights to not be in a public sector union. The Fourth Department disagreed with this interpretation and found that the various dictionary definitions of the term “solicitation” did not require a financial gain – rather, it defined “solicitation” simply as a way to petition, urge or plea.¹ Based on the plain definition, the Court found that the Freedom Foundation was going to use the information to solicit employees by urging them to opt out of union membership. Therefore, the Court ruled that Jefferson County did not have to disclose the information since the release would be an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy and dismissed the case.

Although this case was in the Fourth Department, and does not control throughout NYS, it is a persuasive decision that can be used by state agencies when denying similar requests in the future.

¹ The Court also reasoned that since the statutory exemption listed both “solicitation” and “fund-raising,” it did not make sense to give both terms the same meaning of requiring a financial benefit.



The Supreme Court Case of *Muldrow v. City of St. Louis:* A Cautionary Tale

On April 17, 2024, the Supreme Court issued a unanimous decision in favor of an employee who filed a lawsuit alleging sex discrimination in violation of Title VII after she was transferred within her organization. In *Muldrow v. City of St. Louis*, 144 S.Ct. 967 (2024), the Court vacated the decision of United States Court of Appeals for the Eighth Circuit and held that a Title VII claimant needs to show simply that they suffered “worse treatment,” not “significant harm” in order to prevail.

The case began when the St. Louis Police Department transferred Sergeant Jatonya Clayborn Muldrow out of the Intelligence Division. Sergeant Muldrow had worked in the Intelligence Division for nearly a decade, where she worked as a plainclothes officer on weekdays, Monday through Friday, investigating public corruption and human trafficking cases, overseeing the Gang Unit and serving as the head of the Gun Crimes Unit. Sergeant Muldrow was also deputized as a Task Force Officer with the Federal Bureau of Investigation. She held FBI credentials, had an unmarked take-home vehicle, and had authority to investigate cases outside of St. Louis.

Then, in 2017, Sergeant Muldrow was reassigned by a new Commander to a uniformed job in the Department’s Fifth

District. Sergeant Muldrow was replaced with a male police officer, who was described as being a “better fit” for the “dangerous work” of the position. *Id.*, at 972. Notably, Sergeant Muldrow’s rank and pay remained the same. However, her new position changed to a rotating schedule, which involved weekend shifts, and removed perks such as her FBI status and having an unmarked vehicle. Moreover, the new assignment changed the substance of Sergeant Muldrow’s duties to supervising parole officers and other administrative matters. The Court characterized the transfer as moving Sergeant Muldrow from a “premier position” into a “more administrative” uniformed role. *Id.*, at 972.

The City of St. Louis argued for dismissal of the case since Sergeant Muldrow’s rank and pay remained the same and, therefore, she suffered no significant change in working conditions. Both parties agreed that the transfer changed the “terms and conditions” of her employment by changing the “what, where and when of her police work,” but the City argued that these changes were immaterial. The District Court agreed and the Court of Appeals for the Eighth Circuit affirmed.

The Supreme Court disagreed. The Court reviewed the express language of the law and concluded that none of the language either expressly or implicitly imposed a rule that harm suffered in a Title VII lawsuit must be significant. To the contrary, the Court said that the plain language of the law stated that to “Discriminate against means treat worse, here based on sex.... But neither that phrase nor any other says anything about how much worse...there is nothing to otherwise establish an elevated threshold of harm. To demand ‘significance’ is to add words– and significant words, as it were—to the statute Congress enacted. It is to impose a new requirement on a Title VII claimant, so that the law as applied

demands something more of her than the law as written.” *Id.*, at 974.

The Court went on to refer to other examples of transfers where the courts incorrectly rejected Title VII claims simply because the “courts rewrote Title VII, compelling workers to make a showing that the statutory text does not require.” The examples included a case where a school principal was forced into a non-school-based administrative role supervising fewer employees (See *Cole v. Wake Cty. Bd. of Education*, 834 Fed. Appx.820, 821 (CA4 2021). *Id.*, at 975.

At the end of the decision, the Court repeated the law set forth in Title VII, which is, “An employer may not, based on sex, fail or refuse to hire, or discharge any person or otherwise discriminate against them with respect to their compensation, terms conditions or privileges of employment.” *Id.*, at 975. Then, it concluded that there was no need for courts to introduce a significant-harm standard simply “to achieve what some employers might think a desirable result.” *Id.*, at 976.

The *Muldrow v. City of St. Louis* case is a cautionary tale for all employers. It is not enough to argue that an action, like a transfer, is not discriminatory simply because there is no monetary harm. Employers should take care to review the changes of all the terms and conditions of employment, as a whole, to determine whether the employee is or is not being made worse. Giving consideration to the job in its entirety, including, for example, its schedule, location, duties, perks, salary and title must all be considered in the analysis of whether or not an employee is being discriminated against under Title VII.

LEGAL UPDATE: APPR



In June, Governor Hochul enacted legislation to amend the Education Law, which effectively overhauls the annual professional performance review (“APPR”) law established in 2010. The bill repeals Education Law Section 3020-b, amends Section 3012-d, and adopts a new Section 3012-e. The repeal strikes down a law that had coupled performance reviews with tenure requirements, and had been the source of frustration among educators for fourteen years. In its place, Section 3012-d and 3012-e create a new framework for professional performance standards, which appear to be more focused on district needs and professional growth.

The bill is effective immediately. However, districts have eight (8) years, or until 2032, to continue to use their existing plans pursuant to Section 3012-d. By June 30, 2032, districts must submit a new Section 3012-e Plan to the NYS Education Department (SED) for approval and adoption.

Districts and BOCES may begin using 3012-e Plans as early as the 2024-2025 school year. However, Section 3012-e Plans must be submitted on a form and in a manner prescribed by the Commissioner, which has not yet been released. Regulations related to Section 3012-e are expected to be released later this year.

Regulations notwithstanding, the enacted law sets forth the following key components of Section 3012-e:

1. All plans must be collectively bargained;
2. All plans must include performance reviews and these shall:
 - a. Include the criteria by which classroom teachers and building principals are reviewed and a description of the review procedures;
 - b. Consist of multiple measures, provided that one measure shall be classroom observations. The number and type of observations may be different for both teachers and principals. Also, one measure may be used to address one or more standards;
 - c. Provide timely and actionable feedback to the classroom teacher or building principal;
 - d. Assign ratings on each teaching and educational leadership standard on a scale of Level 1 through Level 4, with Level 1 indicating a performance below a district's standards, and a Level 4 indicating a performance exceeding a district's standards;
 - e. Include a process for each teacher or building principal to receive support for professional growth each year;
 - f. Provide personalized professional development plans for teachers or principals who receive an overall rating of Level 1 or Level 2; and
 - g. Assess a subset of the teaching and educational leadership standards in a given year, however, the plans must provide an annual review and rating for probationary teachers and building principals.

3. School districts and BOCES must make its most recently adopted and reviewed Plan available on their website;

4. All persons conducting the performance reviews must receive appropriate training consistent with the regulations of the Commissioner; and

5. Section 3012-e does not affect the "unfettered statutory right" of a district or BOCES, to terminate a probationary classroom teacher or building principal for permissible reasons.

Under the new law, parents are entitled to receive a copy of the most recent rating for their child's teacher for the current year. However, performance reviews will not be subject to disclosure pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act, or Article 6 of the Public Officer's Law.

The Office of Personnel Relations will have more updates on this topic when the Regulations and Guidance from the NYS Education Department is issued. Until then, please reach out to us with any questions you may have.



RECENT AREA TEACHER CONTRACT SETTLEMENTS

CAYUGA-ONONDAGA BOCES

	2018-2019	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024	2024-2025	2025-2026	2026-2027	2027-2028	2028-2029	AVG.
BOCES	2.75	2.80	2.80	1.99	4.00	4.00	4.00					3.19
Auburn	2.70	2.75	2.80	2.85	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00				3.39
Cato-Meridian	2.85	2.85	2.70	3.50	3.25	3.00	4.00	3.70	3.40			3.25
Jordan-Elbridge	2.80	2.80	2.80	4.00	4.00	4.00	3.50	3.50	3.50			3.43
Moravia	2.85	2.80	2.80	2.80	4.25	4.25	4.25					3.43
Port Byron	2.60	2.88	2.88	2.88	2.88	3.75 + \$600	3.75					2.98
Skaneateles	3.10	3.00	3.40	3.60	3.60	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			3.63
So. Cayuga	2.75	\$1,900	3.00	\$1,900	4.75	4.50	4.10	3.75				3.81
Union Springs	2.75	2.80	2.85	2.85	2.88	2.99	4.00	3.85	3.75			3.19
Weedsport	2.75	2.75	2.75	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.25	3.25				2.97
	2.79	2.83	2.88	3.05	3.66	3.75	3.89	3.72	3.66			

BROOME-TIOGA BOCES

Chenango Valley	\$2,000	3.00	3.00	3.00	4.0+ \$1250	4.25	3.25					3.30
Deposit	2.99	\$400 + 3.00	\$400 + 3.00	\$400 + 3.00	\$400 + 3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00				3.00
Maine-Endwell	2.95	3.10 + \$300	3.10	4.90	2.96	2.96	2.96					3.31
Owego-Apal.	3.00	3.50	3.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00					3.43
Union-Endicott	3.50	3.50	3.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00					3.57
Vestal	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.15	3.20						3.06
	3.09	3.13	3.02	3.38	3.53	3.57	3.44	3.00				

DELAWARE-CHENANGO-MADISON-OTSEGO BOCES

Sidney	4.00	4.00	4.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00					3.86
--------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	--	--	--	--	------

OSWEGO BOCES

Hannibal	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00					3.00
Phoenix		3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			3.50
	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.50	3.50	4.00	4.00			

TOMPKINS-SENECA-TIOGA BOCES

Candor	2.0 + \$44/step	2.0 + \$44/step	1.25	2.0 + \$45/step	2.0 + \$45/step	3.50						2.38
Dryden	4.42	4.25	4.14	3.31	\$200 + 4.80	\$200 + 4.80	\$200 + 4.80					4.03
Groton	6.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.50	7.00	4.50	4.00	4.00			4.22
Newfield	3.00	3.25	3.00	3.00	3.75	4.00	4.25					3.46
South Seneca	3.25	3.50	3.50	3.50	3.50	7.00	6.00	5.50				4.47
Trumansburg	3.50	3.50	3.00	3.25	3.75	4.00	3.00	4.00	4.50			3.61
	4.03	3.60	2.98	3.21	3.63	5.10	4.44	4.50	4.25			

RECENT AREA TEACHER CONTRACT SETTLEMENTS

WAYNE - FINGER LAKES BOCES

	2018-2019	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024	2024-2025	2025-2026	2026-2027	2027-2028	2028-2029	AVG.
Clyde-Savannah	3.25	3.00	2.0 + \$125	3.30	3.25	3.25	3.25					3.22
Dundee	4.00	3.25	3.25	2.75	2.75	2.75	2.75					3.07
Gananda	3.10	3.20	3.40	3.00	5.00	5.00	4.00	4.00				3.81
Geneva	2.50	3.00	2.50	2.50	2.70	4.00	4.00	3.70	3.20			3.12
Gorham-Middlesex	3.00	3.00	3.20	3.50	3.50	3.50						3.28
Honeoye	3.30	3.35	3.45	3.60	3.60	3.50	3.40					3.46
Lyons	2.90 + \$200	3.10*	3.30*	5.10	3.60	3.60	3.60					3.72
Manchester-Shortsville	2.50	2.50	4.50	4.50	4.00	4.00	4.25	4.00	4.00			3.81
Naples	3.50	3.45	3.35	3.25	3.50	3.50	4.25	4.25	4.25	4.00		3.73
Newark	3.25	3.10	3.20	3.30	3.30	3.30	3.30					3.25
Palmyra-Macedon	2.75	3.25	3.25	3.25	3.25	3.50	4.25	4.25	4.25	4.25	4.00	3.47
Penn Yan	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.0% + \$125	3.0% + \$125	4.00 + \$1500	4.00	4.00				3.40
Phelps-Cl Springs	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.60	3.90	3.40	3.75	3.60	3.50			3.42
Red Creek	3.00	2.50			3.90 + \$600	3.90 + \$600	3.90 + \$600					3.44
Romulus	3.00	2.75	2.75	2.75	3.75	3.75	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00		3.34
Seneca Falls	2.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.80	3.60	3.30	+1,200				3.10
Sodus	3.30	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.95	3.75	3.00	3.00			3.22
		* 2019-20, 2020-21, 2021-22, and 2022-23 or 2% off schedule, or \$12,000 if applicable				* Off Schedule: 2023-24: 3.45%, 2024-25: 3.25%, and 2025-26: 3.0%						
Waterloo	3.50	3.50	3.25	3.25	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00				3.69
Wayne	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.50	3.50	4.25	4.00	4.00	3.75		3.50
Williamson	3.00	3.00	3.75	3.15	3.80	3.50	3.25	3.25				3.34
	3.05	3.05	3.23	3.32	3.58	3.68	3.75	3.84	3.78	4.00	4.00	

* Lyons: 2019-20 and 2020-21 + \$1,000 at 21 years; 2021-22 all unit members received an extra assignment

Denotes Current Contract
Denotes Previous Contract

RECENT AREA NON-INSTRUCTIONAL CONTRACT SETTLEMENTS											
CAYUGA-ONONDAGA BOCES											
	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024	2024-2025	2025-2026	2026-2027	2027-2028	2028-2029	Avg.
BOCES											
Aides (CSEA)	2.75	2.80	1.99	1.99	1.99	3.00					2.42
Non-Instructional	2.80	2.80	1.99	4.00	4.00	4.00					3.27
Auburn											
Aides/Clerical (NYSUT)	2.90	2.85	2.80	2.75	2.75	2.75	\$2/hr				2.80
Bus Drivers (CSEA)	2.95	2.95	2.95	2.90	2.90	4.00	4.00	4.00	3.00	3.00	3.27
Cust/Maint. (CSEA)	2.95	2.95	2.95	2.90	2.90	4.00	4.00	4.00	3.00	3.00	3.27
Nurses (SEIU)	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.50	3.00	3.00		2.61
Cato-Meridian											
Aides/Ass'ts (SEIU)	45¢/hr	45¢/hr	7.00	10.00	10.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			6.50
Bus Drivers (CSEA)	2.25	2.25	10.00	3.00	3.00	3.00					3.92
Cust./Maint. (CSEA)	2.25	2.25	5.00	3.00	3.00	3.00					3.08
Jordan-Elbridge											
Aides/Clerical(SEIU)	3.00	50¢+3.0	50¢+3.0	\$2+4.0	\$1.50+4.0	\$1.50+4.0					3.00
Bus Drivers	3.00	3.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00					3.00
Cust./Maint (SEIU)	3.00	50¢+3.0	50¢+3.0	\$2+4.0	\$1.5+4.0	\$1.5+4.0					3.00
Cafeteria (SEIU)	3.00	50¢+3.0	50¢+3.0	\$2+4.0	\$1.5+4.0	\$1.5+4.0					3.00
Transportation	3.00	3.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00					3.50
Moravia			On 1/1/22 add \$1.40/hr								
Aides/Ass't (CSEA)	70¢/hr	2.75	70¢/hr	2.75	\$2/hr	6.00	5.00				4.13
CSEA	70¢/hr	2.75	70¢/hr	2.75	\$2/hr	6.00	5.00				4.13
Port Byron											
Aides (SEIU)	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			4.00
Cust./Maint. (CSEA)	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			4.00
Cafeteria (CSEA)	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			4.00
Nurse (CSEA)	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			4.00
Clerical (SEIU)	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			4.00
Skaneateles											
Aides (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	\$2.50/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00		3.38
Tchr Ass't (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	\$2.50/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00		3.38
Cust./Maint (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	\$2.50/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00		3.38
Nurses (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	\$2.50/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00		3.38
Clerical (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	\$2.50/hr	4.00	4.00	4.00		3.38
So. Cayuga											
Aides (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13
Tchr. Ass't (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13
Bus Drivers (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13
Bus Mech (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13
Cust./Maint (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13
Cafeteria (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13

RECENT AREA NON-INSTRUCTIONAL CONTRACT SETTLEMENTS											
CAYUGA-ONONDAGA BOCES cont'd											
	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024	2024-2025	2025-2026	2026-2027	2027-2028	2028-2029	Avg.
So. Cayuga cont'd											
Nurses (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13
Clerical (CSEA)	2.75	50¢/hr	3.25	3.25	3.25						3.13
Union Springs											
Aides (SEIU)	*2.50	*2.50	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					2.50
Tchr. Ass'ts (SEIU)	*2.50	*2.50	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					2.50
Bus Drivers (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					3.00
Bus Mech (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					3.00
Cust/Maint. (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					3.00
Cafeteria (CSEA)	3.00	3.00	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					3.00
Nurses (SEIU)	*2.50	*2.50	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					2.50
Clerical (SEIU)	*2.50	*2.50	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					2.50
	*+\$250										
Weedsport											
Aides (CSEA)	2.75	2.75	2.75	3.00	3.25	\$1.50/hr	\$1+3.25	3.50			3.00
Bus Drivers (CSEA)	2.75	2.75	\$5/hr	3.00	3.25	\$1.50/hr	\$1+3.25	3.50			3.00
Bus Mech (CSEA)	2.75	2.75	\$5/hr	3.00	3.25	\$1.50/hr	\$1+3.25	3.50			3.00
Cust/Maint. (CSEA)	2.75	2.75	2.75	3.00	3.25	\$1.50/hr	\$1+3.25	3.50			3.00
C-O BOCES Avg.	2.84	2.83	3.45	3.32	3.49	3.90	4.03	3.83	3.63	3.00	
BROOME-TIOGA BOCES											
Chenango Valley											
Non-Instruct. (NYSUT)	3.00	3.0 or 70¢/hr	3.0 or \$1/hr	3.0 or 70¢/hr	3.0 or 70¢/hr						3.00
Deposit											
CSEA	\$1/hr	4.00	50¢/hr	\$2/hr	\$1.25/hr	\$1.25/hr					4.00
Maine-Endwell											
Cust./Maint.	60¢/hr	50¢/hr	75¢/hr	75¢/hr	75¢/hr	75¢/hr					
Supp Staff	75¢/hr	75¢/hr	70¢/hr	80¢/hr	80¢/hr	80¢/hr					
Transp	\$300 + 3.25	\$300 + 3.25	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr						3.25
Owego-Apalachin											
NYSUT	2.85	2.85	4.99 + 30¢/hr	4.99 + 30¢/hr	4.99 + 30¢/hr	4.00 + 25¢/hr	4.00 + 10¢/hr	4.00 + 10¢/hr			4.08
Union Endicott											
Cafe. Workers	*3.00	3.00	3.00	4.0+80¢	4.0+80¢	4.00	4.00				3.50
Cent Office	3.00	3.00	3.00	4.0+80¢	4.0+80¢	4.00	4.00				3.40
Comp & Tech	3.00	3.00	3.00								3.00
Dist Office	3.00	3.00	3.00								3.00
Maint. Workers	3.00	2.00	2.00	\$1500 + 4.00	\$1500 + 4.00	4.00	4.00				3.00
School Aides	*3.00	*3.00	12.9	3.00	3.00	3.00					5.48
Transp	3.00	3.00	3.00	\$2.50	\$1.50	\$1.50					3.00

RECENT AREA NON-INSTRUCTIONAL CONTRACT SETTLEMENTS											
BROOME-TIOGA BOCES cont'd											
	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024	2024-2025	2025-2026	2026-2027	2027-2028	2028-2029	Avg.
Vestal											
Paraprofessional	3.00	3.00		\$1.25	90¢/hr	80¢/hr	75¢/hr				3.00
Employees	0.00	0.00	10.0	\$3.00	\$1.00	\$1.00					3.33
B-T BOCES Avg	2.61	2.65	5.24	4.00	4.00	3.80	4.00	4.00			
OSWEGO BOCES											
Hannibal											
CSEA	3.00	3.00	2.25	2.00	\$1.75	\$1.75	\$1.50	\$1.50			2.56
HEA	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00				3.00
TOMPKINS-SENECA-TIOGA BOCES											
Dryden					+ \$1.25/hour						
NYSUT	3.50	3.00	3.80	3.80	5.00	5.00	5.00				4.16
Groton											
CSEA	\$1.50/hr	3.00	60¢/hr	\$1.30-\$2	50¢/hr	3.00	3.00				3.00
Newfield			+ 25¢/hr			+ 50¢/hr					
CSEA	3.00	3.00	4.50	4.50	\$ to base	3.00	3.00				3.50
South Seneca											
Local	\$1.40-\$2.00/hr	3.50	2.50	2.50							2.83
Trumansburg											
Local	3.00	3.25	3.00	3.25	3.50	3.50	4.00				3.36
T-S-T BOCES Avg.	3.17	3.15	3.45	3.51	4.25	3.63	3.75				
WAYNE-FINGER LAKES BOCES											
Clyde-Savannah			* 1.5% - 3%, based on years								
Supp Pers (CSEA)	3.50	2.50	*+70¢/hr	2.50	2.50	2.50					2.70
Transp.	3.50	75¢/hr	3.00	1.50	0.00*	*\$/hr	3.50	3.25			2.35
			*up to \$28.50/hr based on yrs			*up to \$34/hr based on yrs					
Dundee											
CSEA	4.00	4.00	4.00	\$1.80	4.00	4.00	4.00				4.00
Gananda											
CSEA	75¢/hr	\$1.25/hr	75¢/hr	\$1.10/hr or 3.8%	4.00	4.00	4.00				4.00
Geneva											
CSEA	75¢/hr	75¢/hr	75¢/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	4.00	4.00	3.60			3.87
Gorham-Middlesex (NYSUT)											
Bus Drivers	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$3/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr				
Cust./F Serv	3.00	3.00	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					3.00
Teacher Aides	3.00	3.00	3.75	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr					3.25
Honeoye			*+\$/hr based on years		*+\$.30-1.20/hr based on years						
NYSUT	3.50	3.35	*3.30	3.30	*3.50	3.00	3.00				3.23

RECENT AREA NON-INSTRUCTIONAL CONTRACT SETTLEMENTS											
WAYNE-FINGER LAKES BOCES con't											
	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024	2024-2025	2025-2026	2026-2027	2027-2028	2028-2029	Avg.
Lyons											
NYSUT	2.90	2.90	2.90	2.90	2.90	2.90					2.90
	+70¢/hr	+70¢/hr	+70¢/hr	+90¢/hr	+90¢/hr	+90¢/hr					
Manchester-S'ville											
CSEA	30¢/hr	60¢/hr	70¢/hr	70¢/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr	\$1/hr				
Naples					* greater of						
CSEA	3.50	3.50	3.75	3.90	*3.9 or 70¢/hr	*3.9 or 70¢/hr					3.74
Newark											
Custodians (CSEA)	2.90	2.75	\$2.25/hr	\$1.75/hr	\$1.00/hr	\$1.00/hr					2.83
Tchr Aides/Asst (NYSUT)	* 2.9 + 40¢/hr	* 2.9 + 35¢/hr	* 2.9 + 35¢/hr	2.5 + 55¢/hr	2.5 + 65¢/hr	2.5 + 75¢/hr					2.70
	* OR Salary Rate										
Palmyra-Macedon											
CSEA, salary	\$2,500	\$2,500	\$2,600 or 3.50	\$2,080 or 3.50	3.50						3.50
CSEA, hourly	\$1.20/hr	\$1.20/hr	\$1.25/hr or 3.50	\$1.00/hr or 3.50	3.50						3.50
Penn Yan						+\$1.15					
CSEA	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00			3.29
Phelps-CI Springs			On 1/1/22 add \$2.50/hr								
Nurses/Food Serv/Bus Driver/Maint	2.25	3.50	3.50	2.00	2.50	2.50					2.71
Aides/Clerical	3.00	4.30	4.50	4.50	4.00	4.00	4.25	4.25			4.10
Red Creek											
CSEA	3.00	+60¢/hr	3.00	4.50	4.00	+\$1.50	+\$1.50	4.00			3.70
Romulus											
CSEA	3¢/hr +2.85%	3¢/hr +2.85%	3¢/hr +2.85%	\$1.50/hr	3.00	3.00	2.75				2.92
	48¢/hr	48¢/hr	48¢/hr								
Seneca Falls											
NEA/NYSUT	3.00	3.00	2.50	2.00							2.91
Sodus					+50-75¢						
CSEA	3.25	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.50	3.50	3.75			3.25
Waterloo											
NEA/NYSUT	3.00	3.00	3.00	% based on YOS	4.00	4.00	4.00				3.50
Wayne											
CSEA	5.00	4.25	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	3.75	3.50			4.06
	or \$1/hr										
Williamson											
CSEA	3.00	3.00	3.00	2.75	2.75	2.75					2.88
WFL BOCES Avg.	3.11	3.35	3.45	2.97	3.07	3.28	3.72	3.83			

AREA UNEMPLOYMENT RATES

New York State Rate

Year	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Ann. Avg.
2024	4.4%	4.5%	4.2%	3.9%	4.2%	4.3%	4.9%	4.9%					
2023	4.6%	4.5%	4.0%	3.7%	3.8%	4.2%	4.1%	4.4%	4.0%	4.4%	4.0%	4.4%	4.2%

Syracuse, NY Metropolitan Statistical Area

Year	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Ann. Avg.
2024	4.4%	4.5%	4.2%	3.7%	3.8%	3.7%	4.1%	4.0%					
2023	4.1%	3.9%	3.4%	2.6%	3.0%	3.3%	3.1%	3.5%	3.2%	3.5%	3.6%	4.1%	3.4%

Cayuga County Statistical Area

Year	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Ann. Avg.
2024	4.5%	4.7%	4.3%	3.8%	3.6%	3.5%	4.2%	4.0%					
2023	4.2%	4.0%	3.6%	2.6%	2.9%	3.0%	3.1%	3.6%	3.0%	3.3%	3.5%	4.2%	3.4%

Broome County Statistical Area

Year	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Ann. Avg.
2024	5.0%	4.9%	4.5%	4.0%	4.1%	4.1%	4.6%	4.5%					
2023	4.7%	4.2%	3.7%	2.7%	3.1%	3.5%	3.5%	3.9%	3.4%	3.8%	3.9%	4.7%	3.8%

Ithaca, NY Metropolitan Statistical Area

Year	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Ann. Avg.
2024	3.5%	3.5%	3.2%	2.9%	3.5%	3.8%	3.9%	3.9%					
2023	3.5%	2.9%	2.4%	2.0%	2.5%	3.0%	2.9%	3.2%	2.8%	3.2%	2.9%	3.5%	2.9%

Ontario/Seneca/Wayne/Yates Statistical Area

Year	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Ann. Avg.
2024	4.4%	4.5%	4.1%	3.5%	3.4%	3.3%	3.6%	3.4%					
2023	4.0%	3.7%	3.3%	2.4%	2.6%	2.8%	2.7%	3.1%	2.8%	3.1%	3.2%	3.9%	3.1%

Rochester, NY Metropolitan Statistical Area

Year	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Ann. Avg.
2024	4.3%	4.4%	4.1%	3.7%	3.8%	3.7%	4.1%	4.0%					
2023	4.0%	3.7%	3.3%	2.5%	2.9%	3.1%	3.2%	3.5%	3.2%	3.6%	3.6%	4.1%	3.4%

** Please note that 2023 data has been updated as labor force statistics for all LAUS areas are revised each year as part of the benchmarking process. The annual benchmarking process is part of the nationwide re-estimating procedure mandated by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics.*

Source: New York State Department of Labor Statistics

www.labor.state.ny.us

CONSUMER PRICE INDICES

INDEX 1982-84 BASE YEAR=100	% INCREASE FROM PRIOR MONTH	% INCREASE FROM PRIOR YEAR
-----------------------------------	-----------------------------------	----------------------------------

July 2024

NY-Northeastern New Jersey Area

1. All Urban Consumers	335.642	0.3	4.1
2. Urban Wage Earners & Clerical Workers	330.340	0.4	4.5

U.S. City Average

1. All Urban Consumers	314.540	0.1	2.9
2. Urban Wage Earners & Clerical Workers	308.501	0.1	2.9

August 2024

NY-Northeastern New Jersey Area

1. All Urban Consumers	336.534	0.3	3.7
2. Urban Wage Earners & Clerical Workers	330.861	0.2	3.9

U.S. City Average

1. All Urban Consumers	314.796	0.1	2.5
2. Urban Wage Earners & Clerical Workers	308.640	0.0	2.4

COST OF LIVING UPDATE

ALL CITIES

NY - NORTHEASTERN NEW JERSEY

Month	Revised Wage Earner Index	%	All Urban Consumers Index	%	Revised Wage Earner Index	%	All Urban Consumers Index	%
Jan-22	276.3	8.2	281.1	7.5	296.2	5.8	300.2	5.1
Feb-22	278.9	8.6	283.7	7.9	297.0	5.7	301.2	5.1
Mar-22	283.2	9.4	287.5	8.5	300.9	6.8	305.0	6.1
Apr-22	284.6	8.9	289.1	8.3	303.2	6.8	307.8	6.3
May-22	288.0	9.3	292.3	8.6	305.2	7.0	309.2	6.3
Jun-22	292.5	9.8	296.3	9.1	309.6	7.4	313.6	6.7
Jul-22	292.2	9.1	296.3	8.5	308.5	7.0	312.6	6.5
Aug-22	291.6	8.7	296.2	8.3	309.0	6.9	313.3	6.6
Sep-22	291.9	8.5	296.8	8.2	308.5	6.1	313.3	6.6
Oct-22	293.0	7.9	298.0	7.7	308.8	5.8	314.3	6.0
Nov-22	292.5	7.1	297.7	7.1	309.6	5.7	315.0	5.9
Dec-22	291.1	6.3	296.8	6.5	309.9	5.9	315.7	6.3
Jan-23	293.6	6.3	299.2	6.4	312.2	6.0	318.2	6.0
Feb-23	295.1	5.8	300.8	6.0	313.3	5.5	319.3	6.0
Mar-23	296.0	4.5	301.8	5.0	312.8	4.0	319.0	4.6
Apr-23	297.7	4.6	303.4	4.9	313.2	3.3	319.2	3.7
May-23	298.4	3.6	304.1	4.0	313.7	2.8	320.0	3.5
Jun-23	299.4	2.3	305.1	3.0	315.1	1.8	321.3	2.5
Jul-23	299.9	2.6	305.7	3.2	316.1	2.5	322.5	3.2
Aug-23	301.6	3.4	307.0	3.7	318.3	3.0	324.4	3.5
Sep-23	302.3	3.6	307.8	3.7	320.0	3.7	325.6	3.7
Oct-23	302.1	3.1	307.7	3.7	320.2	3.7	325.3	3.5
Nov-23	301.2	3.0	307.0	3.1	319..6	3.2	324.5	3.0
Dec-23	300.7	3.3	306.7	3.4	319.6	3.1	324.7	2.9
Jan-24	302.2	2.9	308.4	3.1	322.8	3.4	328.0	3.1
Feb-24	304.3	3.1	310.3	3.2	323.1	3.1	328.6	2.9
Mar-24	306.5	3.5	312.3	3.5	324.3	3.7	329.8	3.4
Apr-24	307.8	3.4	313.5	3.4	325.8	4.0	331.3	3.8
May-24	308.2	3.3	314.1	3.3	326.7	4.1	332.6	3.9
Jun-24	308.1	2.9	314.2	3.0	329.2	4.5	334.8	4.2
Jul-24	308.5	2.9	314.5	2.9	330.3	4.5	335.6	4.1
Aug-24	308.6	2.4	314.8	2.5	330.9	3.9	336.5	3.7
Sep-24								
Oct-24								
Nov-24								
Dec-24								

THE ADVOCATE STAFF

Editorial Assistant & Desktop Publisher:

Kelly Walsh

Contributors:

Randy J. Ray •

Nick Minderler • Mark Detwiler • Stacy Tamburrino

Published by:

Cayuga-Onondaga BOCES

Office of Personnel Relations

1879 West Genesee Street Road

Auburn, NY 13021-9430

Telephone: 315-255-7683 • Fax: 315-255-7625

** All Rights Reserved*

PAST ISSUES OF “THE ADVOCATE”

Past issues of “The Advocate” can be read and/or downloaded for your reference at your convenience.

Simply go to our website at www.cayboces.org, navigate through Professional Services, then Labor Relations, then click the link to “The Advocate” newsletter.

NOTICE OF NON-DISCRIMINATION

The Cayuga-Onondaga BOCES does not discriminate on the basis of an individual’s actual or perceived race, color, religion, creed, ethnicity, national origin, citizenship status, age, marital status, partnership status, disability, predisposing genetic characteristics, sexual orientation, gender/sex, military status, veteran status, domestic violence victim status or political affiliation, and additionally does not discriminate against students on the basis of weight, gender identity, gender expression, and religious practices or any other basis prohibited by New York state and/or federal non-discrimination laws in employment or its programs and activities. The BOCES provides equal access to community and youth organizations.

Inquiries regarding the District’s non-discrimination policies should be directed to:

Randy J. Ray

Director of Personnel Relations and Civil Rights Compliance Officer

1879 West Genesee Street Road

Auburn, NY 13021

(315) 255-7683

rray@cayboces.org